

Appendix I

Creating the Density, Mix and Duration Variable from the Legal Periodicals Project

As noted in the text, there were five stages involved in the generation of key variables from the Legal Periodicals Project: (1) identifying representative historical listings of legal periodicals for countries throughout the world; (2) translating periodical titles into English; (3) screening and classifying periodicals; (4) estimating missing values for key pieces of data (beginning date, termination date); and (5) creating raw density and duration variables for a mix of legal publications. Each is discussed below.

Identifying Legal Periodicals

We began the process of identifying the legal periodicals operating across the world by surveying global online bibliographic services such as WorldCat, Ulrichs and the Library of Congress. Each provides extensive listings for a wide range of periodicals. After discussions with law librarians and extensive comparisons of the nation-specific holdings of different services, we decided to utilize WorldCat. WorldCat is a union catalogue that merges the electronic catalogues of all contributing libraries into one searchable database (<http://www.worldcat.org/whatis/default.jsp>). While it is clear that WorldCat does not list every periodical ever published in the world, its global network of contributing libraries appeared to be the most inclusive. Moreover, its temporal reach is impressive; it includes a huge number of older periodical series that are no longer published.

To generate a country-specific list of legal periodicals we initiated 165 on-line searches (one for each country in the SID project). In these searches we employed "Serial Publications" as the "search restrictor" within the WorldCat search engine. WorldCat defines serial publications as "periodicals, newspapers, annuals, journals, memoirs, proceedings, monographs." In these 165 restricted searches we used two *subject keywords* in WorldCat's descriptor field: "law" and the name of the country. This generated a set of a country-specific listing of 45,613 legal periodicals in 79 languages. We used WorldCat's bibliographic export feature to download these listings in machine readable format.

The WorldCat "downloads" included the periodical title along with a score of variables containing information about each title. The most relevant variables are the publication's language, its publisher, frequency of publication (quarterly, annually, monthly, etc.), the beginning and ending date of the series, and a set of "descriptors" used by librarians to characterize the journal's focus. Descriptors include terms such as: law review, legal digest, law reports, bar association, law school, study guide, law and legislation, cases, research, law reform, bibliographies, gazettes, history, philosophy, etc. They also frequently included substantive terms such as criminal law, property law, tax law, women and the law, petroleum law, mining industry, etc. These descriptors are vital to this effort because "law-related serial publications" include a large number of items that are not legal periodicals; they also helped in differentiating scholarly publications from legal digests as well as identifying more specialized publications.

While WorldCat arguably provides the best global source of information on legal periodicals, its limitations should be understood. First, like all bibliographic listings, WorldCat's depends on the accuracy with which librarians in contributing libraries categorize their materials. If none of the

contributing libraries that provide listings of a given periodical to WorldCat categorize it as “legal,” it will not appear in our downloaded listings. However, multiple libraries contribute lists to WorldCat’s union catalogue and *every* contributing library would have to fail to categorize a legal publication as law-related for it not to be listed. This, of course, suggests that only marginal publications will be affected. A related problem is that one or more libraries may mistakenly categorize a non-legal publication as legal. Our screening process (described below) allowed us to eliminate publications that – based on their title and descriptors – do not appear to be law-related. A second limitation is that, for a variety of reasons, WorldCat does less well in capturing electronic publications, which may be more prevalent in recent times in certain types of countries. While it is difficult to assess the importance of this deficiency, its impact is mitigated by our emphasis on long, continuous runs of legal periodicals. As discussed in the text, it is the existence of an extended dialogue on legal matters that is most useful for gauging the extent to which a law-based order has been institutionalized within a country. Since many periodical runs date to the 19th century, missing a handful of electronic periodicals published in the 21st century will have only a minimal effect on the measures constructed here.

A final limitation that should be mentioned relates to the mix of the contributing libraries from which WorldCat derives their listings. While WorldCat has a broad range of contributing libraries, and a more diverse set of listings than any other bibliographic service,¹ the majority of its contributors are American and European libraries. This matters because our effort to construct valid cross-national gauges of legal periodicals rests on our ability to generate unbiased listings of publications across countries. Several considerations suggest that the listings we generated from WorldCat’s holdings meet this criterion. Perhaps the most important is the fact that the globalization of economic activities over the past several decades has given rise to widespread demands among more developed nations for information on legal matters in countries throughout the world. A concrete manifestation of this is a recent effort by Harvard and Yale to compile comprehensive, global periodical holdings. The extensive colonial ties of European nations, particularly to African countries, also contribute to the diversity of holdings in WorldCat. Moreover, the inclusiveness of the listings we were able to generate is enhanced by the fact that we are dealing in an “applied” domain. Listings in a field such as literature may not be as extensive as the listings for law, which is more closely related to the material well-being of a country. Thus, if law matters within a particular nation, and a given legal periodical speaks with some authority to relevant legal matters, then it is likely that it will generate some demand among users in the U.S. and Europe.² This does not mean that every legal periodical in every country will be captured, but it militates against the type of bias that would undermine the inferences we wish to draw.³

¹ We did a handful of comparisons between Ulrich’s and WorldCat and the results were encouraging. For example, use WorldCat our search procedure identified 450 legal publications in Argentina; Ulrich’s produced only 54.

² The breadth of the listings we were able to generate can be documented by the fact that, of the 175 searches conducted we were able to identify legal publications in all but seven countries: Bhutan, Djibouti, Guinea-Bissau, Iceland, Maldives, Montenegro and Myanmar.

³ We were able to generate some anecdotal evidence for the inclusiveness of our listing by searching for indigenous bibliographies of legal publications in Africa, the region that was considered most problematic. We uncovered such a bibliography for Nigeria (Index to Nigerian Legal Periodicals, 1946-1981; Nigerian Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, Lagos. (1983). Of the 16 periodicals it listed we captured 14.

Translating Periodical Titles

After compiling the global list of legal periodicals, the next was to translate the titles of the non-English listings into English. Almost 34% of the downloaded titles (15,355 of 45,613) were in one of 78 non-English languages. These titles had to be translated into English because the wide range of legal periodicals generated by the WorldCat downloads had to be screened and categorized before meaningful legal periodical measures could be constructed. The periodical title was an essential “marker” in the screening and classification process.

Table A-1 lists the 79 languages included in the list of downloaded periodicals, along with the number of titles in each language. To facilitate the translation of non-English materials into English, we sorted the periodicals into 79 language-based files, irrespective of country. We then initiated a search for qualified translators using a variety of University of Illinois resources: area study centers, language departments, international student centers, faculty with language proficiencies, referrals, etc. Once we identified a qualified translator who agreed to assist us (each was offered monetary compensation for their efforts), we sent them a copy of the language file along with a description of the project and the required tasks. Most translators were simply asked to translate the title of the periodical into English. For many non-Latin based languages, however, translators were also asked to indicate whether the government published the periodical. This was important because the publisher was also an important marker used in classifying the downloaded listings.

Using this process, we secured translations for sixty-one languages – all but seventeen rather obscure languages that are bolded in Table A-1: Adygei, Amharic, Central Khmer, Chuvash, Esperanto, Estonian, Icelandic, Kara-Kalpak, Lao, Malayalam, Maltese, Moldavian, Oriya, Oromo, Pashto, Somali, and Western Frisian. Periodicals published in these seventeen languages totaled only 63 out of over 45,000 periodicals (.1%); only one language set contained more than ten periodicals (Estonian, 24). The impact of these missing translations is minimized by the fact that most legal periodicals in the nations with missing translations were published in another language (Spanish, English, French, Portuguese, etc.). Thus, we were able to capture most of the legal periodicals in nations with indigenous languages that we could not translate. It should also be noted that many of the titles that were translated from indigenous languages turned out to be marginal publications that did not survive the screening and classification process.

Screening and Classifying Legal Periodicals

A review of the English titles of the legal publications demonstrated that the listings had to be both screened and classified. Screening had to be done for two reasons. The first, and most important reason, was the existence of duplicate titles, which were the result of multiple entries by contributing libraries. These duplicates were identified and eliminated by sorting country-specific files of periodicals by title. If two or more periodicals had identical titles, and matched up on other criteria (author, frequency, publication range, etc.), all but one were eliminated. Because some entries by contributing libraries had more complete information than others, we were careful to retain the entries with the most complete information. In some cases we used information from duplicates to provide a more complete set of information on a periodical. Eliminating duplicates reduced the number of listings from 45,613 to 25,659, about a 44% reduction. The second reason for screening was the existence of some demonstrably non-legal

Table A-1
Legal Publications Language Inventory List

Language of Publication	Number of Publications	Language of Publications	Number of Publications
Adygei	1	Lao	1
Afrikaans	53	Latin	19
Albanian	9	Latvians	34
Amharic	11	Lithuanian	32
Arabic	334	Macedonian	14
Armenian	13	Malay	32
Azerbaijani	15	Malayalam	1
Basque	5	Maltese	1
Belarusian	10	Moldavian	3
Bengali	8	Mongolian	8
Bosnian	5	Nepali	7
Bulgarian	85	Norwegian	52
Catalan	31	Oriya	1
Central Khmer	2	Oromo	1
Chinese	1102	Persian	56
Chuvash	2	Polish	187
Croatian	108	Portuguese	1168
Czech	135	Pashto	3
Danish	118	Romanian	85
Dutch	220	Russian	889
English	30258	Serbian	82
Esperanto	1	Sinhalese	2
Estonian	24	Slovak	35
Finnish	43	Slovenian	20
French	1974	Somali	2
Georgian	21	Spanish	3205
German	1560	Swahili	21
Greek	72	Swedish	91
Hebrew	131	Tajik	4
Hindi	11	Tamil	1
Hungarian	88	Thai	42
Icelandic	6	Turkish	83
Indonesian	442	Turkmen	1
Iranian	1	Ukrainian	99
Italian	578	Undetermined	38
Japanese	1138	Urdu	5
Kara-Kalpak	1	Uzbek	7
Kazakh	8	Vietnamese	22
Korean	626	Western Frisian	2
Kyrgyz	6		

Note: Bold implies language was not translated

periodicals in the downloads. Most of these were irrelevant government documents, such as publications dealing with driver licenses or insurance matters. An occasional journal title was so clearly non-legal that it was excluded; in marginal cases we deferred to the judgment of the classifying librarian. This second class of screened listings was rare, affecting far less than 1% of the listings.

The screened legal periodicals had to be classified because the legal publications generated from WorldCat's listings included thousands of publications that were irrelevant to the creation of a measure of formalized legal discourse. A multi-wave examination of titles and descriptors generated a classification scheme and a categorization procedure that was implemented by multiple classifiers. This scheme is reported in Table A-2; the guidelines used to implement the classification scheme are reported in Appendix II. The categories, implementation procedures and results are discussed in the following sections.

Table A-2
Legal Publication Classification Scheme

Category	Type of Serial Publication
1	Scholarly Law Journals-General
2	Scholarly Law Journals-Specialized
3	Law Digests: General
4	Law Digests: Specialized
5	Practitioner Guides/Magazines/Newspapers
6	Compilations of Statutes/Codes/ordinances
7	Published Decrees, Edicts, Orders
8	Official national Gazettes
9	Court Decision Reports
10	Miscellaneous Government Proceedings, Ruling, Reports
11	User/Consumer/Student Materials
12	Legal Registries/Directories/Bibliographies
13	Irregular/non-serial Reports, Proceedings

Categories of legal publications

The first four categories listed in Table A-2 include periodicals that are highly relevant to the derivation of a measure of formalized legal discourse. There are 7,548 periodicals that fall within one of these categories. The first two include scholarly journals, both general (2,615) and specialized (1,605). Periodicals classified within Category 1 or 2 had titles that suggested that they were academic journals containing articles that were critical, analytic, evaluative or thought-provoking. They were mainly published by academic institutions. Journals with Category 2 had a title that suggested they focused on some branch of the law (Journal of Criminal Law, Tax Law Review, etc.) or were published by a corporate entity that had a specific focus. These specialized journals were important to categorize separately because they may reflect a more mature legal order. The second two categories are legal digests, general (1,135) and specialized (2,193). Periodicals in Category 3 and 4 are different from scholarly journals in that they provide

summaries or compilations of legal happenings or developments. Moreover, they are often published by private groups or associations – as opposed to universities.

The next five categories of legal publications listed in Table A-2 are not relevant to constructing a gauge of formalized legal discourse; but they are plausibly germane to other components of the SID project. Thus, a good deal of care was taken in classifying them. These categories include 10,336 publications. Category 5 is labeled Practitioner Guides/Magazines/Newspapers (4,152). It includes associational publications oriented to bar or court matters. These are less relevant to a gauge of formalized legal discourse as they relate more to sociological/organizational matters within the legal realm than to the law per se. Category 6 is labeled “Compilations of Statutes/Codes/Ordinances.” It includes a large number of publications (2,348) that contain the actual texts of what appear to be legislatively enacted laws. In contrast, Category 7 is labeled “Published Decrees, Edicts, and Orders.” It includes 409 government publications of executive or declaratory acts. Category 8 is entitled “Official National Gazettes” and includes 1,424 registers that contain the official postings of national governments or governmental subunits. The final category in this group is labeled “Court Decision Reports.” Publications in Category 9 are simply reports of court decisions; 2,003 publications fell within it.

The next three categories of legal publications are not considered relevant to any part of the SID project. They include 6,137 publications. The first of these categories (Category 10) includes a variety of government reports, including budgetary and tax reports; it had 4,297 entries. These include a range of miscellaneous materials that varied greatly across countries. Most of the publications included in Category 10 are, from the perspective of this research, merely flotsam. Category 11, User/Consumer/Student Materials (693) contain a set of materials oriented to legal consumers and students. While some of the materials in this category are plausibly relevant, it is unlikely that the WorldCat system would provide a sufficiently representative listing of publications for them to be useful. The demand for such materials is simply too uneven across countries. Category 12, “Legal Registries/Directories/ Bibliographies” contains materials concerned with the listing of legal actors and institutions, as well as indexes to legal periodicals and reference materials. As might be expected, these listings are sporadic as there is relatively little demand for many of them. Including these 1,147 documents would have introduced a good deal of cross-national bias. The last category, “Irregular/Non-serial Reports, Proceedings,” contains 1,638 entries. It was created to deal with the existence of non-periodicals.

Classification procedures

To screen and classify over 25,000 listings into one of the thirteen categories listed in Table A-2 required the development, and systematic deployment, of a variety of criteria, or “markers.” It also required several iterations of multiple, joint reviews by different categorizers. The main markers were the title, the corporate author, and the WorldCat descriptor terms; their relevance varied by category (i.e., some were more useful in some categories than others). The classification process began with an extended pretest phase that inductively developed a preliminary classification scheme and a set of markers to assign cases to those categories (the final versions are reported in Table A-2 and Appendix II). After the preliminary scheme and markers were developed, an effort was initiated to test, refine and improve them. This was accomplished by the implementation of a series of categorization efforts. The idea behind this iterative processing was that repeated examinations of increasingly refined subsets of entries

would lead to more appropriate categories, better markers, and the reclassification of non-conforming publications.

Three waves of this categorization process were conducted on the *language files* as they were returned by translators. Conducting these reviews in the language files was useful both because they provided a diverse range of publication styles and were (usually) manageable in size. As can be seen in Table A-1, only six of the files contained more than 1,000 entries and only the English file was truly large. To enhance our understanding of the type of publication systems and styles deployed across the world we made a conscious effort to focus on a diverse set of languages and countries early in the process. The English file (which was divided between US publications and non-US publications) was coded toward the end of the early implementations.

In each implementation a graduate student categorized the publications and earmarked difficult codings. Each of these processed files was reviewed by the project director and feedback was provided to the graduate student. This led to a refinement of the preliminary scheme and an enhanced understanding of how to use the markers. By the third wave of language-specific codings the final classification scheme had emerged and most of the duplicate publications had been removed. At that point the publications were integrated into a single file that included all languages and countries. This was a greatly reduced file because of the elimination of duplicates. Also, the isolation of miscellaneous government reports, bibliographies, case reporters, gazettes, etc. made it much easier to focus on the most relevant categories.

Several reviews of the integrated file were conducted. Most of these focused on categories 1-4 (see Table A-2); our main concern with the other categories (5-13) was that they did not include any of the periodicals that belonged to categories 1-4. The first check on the integrated file was conducted by writing a script that extracted a set of terms from the 'WorldCat Descriptor Column' that was crucial to assigning publications to categories (research, history, law review, law reform, legal digest, cases, gazettes, etc.). A dummy variable was constructed for every case that included a relevant term; many included more than one. This was an important check because the WorldCat descriptor column often includes a number of items and – when dealing with thousands of publications and a great deal of information – it is easy to miss a key term. The strategy here was to examine categorizations that had markers associated with one category but were assigned to a different category. For example, if the marker was “law review” and the publication was assigned to category 5, then the categorization was scrutinized. Also, if the marker was “legal digest” and the publication was not assigned to category 3 or 4 then it was reviewed. The same was done for markers such as gazettes, bibliography, index, etc.

This descriptor-term check corrected a number of miscategorizations. Once it was completed both the project graduate student and director conducted another set of sequential checks on a category-by-category basis for categories 1-4. This check was much more manageable with the refined and smaller subsets of publications. The graduate student then did a series of final checks for each of these four categories. The first was for duplicate entries and it was conducted by sorting the files by English title, country, and corporate author. The second check was for non-periodicals, which was conducted for entries that had missing values on the “frequency of publication” variable; it was to screen entries whose titles suggested one-shot publications. Finally, a check was conducted for clues in periodical titles for cases in which the “frequency of publication” variable was missing. There were a good many titles with terms such as “monthly,”

“quarterly,” “annual,” etc. that had missing values on the frequency of publication variable. These clues were used to fill in those missing values.

A final check was completed by an advanced graduate student not associated with the project. The student was given the categories and guidelines and was asked to review the final set of classifications in categories 1-4 and to identify periodicals that did not appear to meet the criteria. The project director then reviewed the marked entries and determined whether reclassifications were necessary.

Illustrations and assessments of the classification process

Creating and implementing the classification process described above was essential to the development of a refined cross-national gauge of formal legal discourse. Using the raw WorldCat downloads to calculate a set of legal discourse measures would have introduced much unnecessary noise and cross-national bias into the measures. To avoid this it was important to focus on those publications most concerned with dialogues on law and legal doctrine. However, despite the care used to develop and implement this categorization process, no claim can be made to that we were wholly successful in accurately classifying legal publications. There were simply too many publications and both too much and too little information. We did not have all the information that we would have liked – and the information that was available sometimes exceeded our ability to ingest it fully.

This having been said, the procedures used here generated a reasonable and defensible classification of legal periodicals. To illustrate this we selected a random sample of fifty publications from each of the first four categories listed in Table A-2. The titles of these periodicals are listed in Tables A-3 to A-6 along with: an entry number (to facilitate references), the country, the volumes published each year, the corporate author, and an abbreviated listing of the WorldCat descriptor information. The descriptor information provided by WorldCat was too detailed, in most cases, to reproduce in its entirety; moreover much of this information was duplicative and/or in a different language. Each of the tables also includes three columns of “markers” we used in classifying the publications: a Publisher Marker (column 2); a Title Marker (column 3); and a Descriptor Marker (column 4). A ‘1’ is placed in the appropriate column when the marker was present. The utility of the markers varies across categories; where there was unusual ambiguity we sometimes looked to the frequency of publication column “Volumes per Year” (column 8). We used these markers to re-evaluate the categorizations in each of the random samples, highlighting possible miscategorizations and indicating what a more appropriate classification would be. The following discussions report the results of this check.

Table A-3 includes the random sample of periodicals listed as “Scholarly Law Journals – General.” The two most important markers here are the Publisher Marker and the Title Marker. When the publisher was an academic or an academic-like unit (i.e., institute, centers, etc.), the Publisher Marker is given a ‘1’. When the publication’s title indicates a scholarly journal with a general orientation, the Title Marker is given a ‘1’. Finally, when the WorldCat descriptor indicates a periodical with a general reference (Law, Constitutional Law, Public Law), the Descriptor Marker is given a ‘1’. Category 1 publications are generally easier to differentiate from the specialized publications in Category 2 and Category 4 on the basis of title. However, titles are often less useful in differentiating Category 1 and Category 3 publications, though the latter frequently had more “applied” titles. The Publisher and Descriptor markers

Table A-3
Random Sample of Scholarly Law Journals (Category 1)

Entry	Publisher	Marker?	Title Marker?	Descriptor Marker?	More Likely Category	English Title	Country	Volumes per Year	Language	Authors	WorldCat Descriptors Abbreviated
1	1	1	1	1		Academic Forum of College of Political Science and Law	China		Chinese	Nan kai University	Law -- China -- Periodicals.
2	1	1	1?	1?	?	Annals of the Academy of Right and Social Sciences	Spain		Spanish	Quesada, Ernesto.; 1858-1934.	Law -- Periodicals. Real property -- Tunisia.
3				1		Arguments	Italy	2	Italian		Law -- Italy -- Periodicals.
4	1	1	1	1		Bulletin of the Law School of the University of Coimbra.	Portugal	1	Portuguese	Universidade de Coimbra.; Faculdade de Direito.	Law -- Portugal -- Periodicals.
5		1	1	1		China law quarterly	China	4	Chinese	Hong Kong.; China Law Unit.; Attorney General	Law -- China -- Periodicals.
6		1	1	1		China law review.	China		English	Zhongguo ke xue yuan.; Fa xue yan jiu suo.	Law -- China -- Periodicals.
7	1	1	1	1		Commentaries.	United States		English	Boston University.; School of Law.	Law -- United States -- Periodicals
8	1	1	1	1		Contemporary Polish Law	Poland	4	Polish	Instytut Nauk Prawnych (Polska Akademia Nauk)	Law -- Poland -- Periodicals.
9		1	1	1		Critique of the Law	Italy	4	Italian		Law -- Italy -- Periodicals.
10		1	1	1	2	Economic Law Studies	Poland		Polish	Lódzkie Towarzystwo Naukowe.	Law -- Periodicals. Poland Economics
11	1	1	1	1		Ethiopian law review.	Ethiopia	2	English	Yaltyopya sivil sarvis kolég.; Faculty of Law.	Law -- Ethiopia.
12		1	1	1		General journal of law, legislation and jurisprudence	Brazil	6	Portuguese		Law -- Brazil -- Periodicals. Law reports, digests, etc.
13	1	1	1	1		Issues of the Law and Politics Studies Institute	Hungary		Hungarian	A. M. Kir. Ferencz József University	Law -- Periodicals -- Hungary. Political science
14		1	1	1		Journal of constitutional law	Korea, South	1	Korean	Korea (South).; Honpop Chaep'anso.	Constitutional law -- Korea (South) -- Periodicals.
15		1	1	1		Journal of legislation and jurisprudence.	Portugal		Portuguese	Portugal.	Law -- Portugal -- Periodicals.
16		1	1	1		Journal of Legislation and Legal Practice in Grisons	Lithuania	4	German		Law -- Switzerland -- Graubünden -- Periodicals.
17		1	1	1		Journal of Public Law	Austria		German		Public law -- Austria -- Periodicals. Public law
18	1	1	1	1		Journal of the Law School	Brazil		Portuguese	United Metropolitan Colleges of São Paulo	Law -- Brazil -- Periodicals.
19		1	1	1	5	Judicial periodical	Argentina	104	Spanish		Law -- Periodicals. Law -- Mexico -- Periodicals.
20		1	1	1		Juridical and Social Essays	Spain		Spanish		Law -- Peru -- Periodicals.
21		1	1	1		Khartoum law review	Sudan	1	English	Jami'at al-Khartum.; Kulliyat al-Qanun.	Law -- Sudan -- Periodicals.
22	1	1	1	1		Law Duty	Indonesia	12	Indonesian	Universitas Darma Agung.; Fakultas Hukum.	Law -- Indonesia -- Periodicals.
23		1	1	1		Law-and-Economics Studies	Italy		Italian		Economics -- Periodicals. Law -- Italy -- Periodicals.
24		1	1	1		Legal Notebooks- Monthly magazine of rights	Colombia	12	Spanish		Law -- Spain -- Periodicals. Law -- Periodicals.
25	1	1	1	1		Legal State	Ukraine	1	Ukrainian	Instytut derzhavy i prava im. V.M. Korets	Law -- Ukraine -- Periodicals. Rule of law
26	1	1	1	1		Magazine of Legal Studies	Spain	1	Spanish	Universidad de Jaén.	Law reviews -- Spain.
27	1	1	1	1		Magazine of Right	Chile		Spanish	Universidad Central (Chile).; Facultad de Derecho	Law -- Chile -- Periodicals.
28	1	1	1	1		Media societias.	Indonesia		Indonesian	Universitas Sam Ratulangi.;	Law -- Indonesia -- Periodicals.
29	1	1	1	1		Natal University law and society review	South Africa	2	English	University of Natal.	Law -- South Africa -- Periodicals.
30		1	1	1		New historic journal of French and foreign law	France	2	French		Law -- France -- History -- Periodicals.
31	1	1	1	1	2	New Penal Forum	Colombia	4	Spanish	Universidad de los Andes (Bogotá, Colombia).;	Public law -- Colombia -- Periodicals.
32		1	1	1		Peruvian Magazine of Public Right	Peru	2	Spanish		Public law -- Peru -- Periodicals.
33		1	1	1		Quarterly journal of law and literature	Japan	1	Japanese	Kumamoto Daigaku.; Hobun Gakkai.	Periodicals. Law -- Japan -- Periodicals.
34	1	1	1	1		Res publica.	South Africa		Afrikaans	University of the Orange Free State.;	Law -- South Africa -- Periodicals.
35	1	1	1	1	2	Review of Law and Administration	Poland		Polish	Uniwersytet Wrocławski im. Bolesława Bieruta.;	Law -- Periodicals. Poland -- Administrative law
36	1	1	1	1		Right XXIst century	Mexico	3	Spanish	Universidad Autónoma de Nuevo León.	Law -- Mexico -- Periodicals.
37	1	1	1	1		Right: Organ of the Seminary of the Faculty of Right	Peru	1	Spanish	Universidad Católica del Perú.;	Law -- Peru -- Periodicals.
38	1	1	1	1		Romanian review of social science. Series of legal sciences	Romania	2	Romanian	Academia Republicii Populare Romine.	Law -- Romania -- Periodicals. Law -- Periodicals.
39	1	1	1	1		Seton Hall constitutional law journal.	United States		English	Seton Hall University.; School of Law.	Constitutional law -- United States -- Periodicals.
40		1	1	1		The Constitutional Review	China	1	Chinese	Zhongguo xian fa xue hui (Taipei, Taiwan)	Law -- China -- Periodicals.
41		1	1	1		Quarterly journal of jurisprudence and legislation.	United Kingdom	4	English		Law -- Great Britain -- Periodicals.
42		1	1	1		The Law of the Italians. Review of Facts, Experiments, Opinions	Italy		Italian		Law -- Italy -- Periodicals.
43		1	1	1		The law of today	Gabon	4	French		Law -- Gabon -- Periodicals.
44	1	1	1	1		The law review.	United States	1	English	John Marshall Law School (Atlanta, Ga.)	Law reviews -- Georgia.
45		1	1	1		The Paduan Forum: Review of Law and Policy	Italy		Italian		Law -- Italy -- Periodicals.
46	1	1	1	1		Themis	Canada	4	French	Université de Montréal.; Faculté de droit.	Law -- Canada -- Periodicals.
47	1	1	1	1		Tokyo Shoka University journal of law and politics	Japan	1	Japanese	Tokyo Shoka Daigaku.	Law -- Japan -- Periodicals.
48		1	1	1		Tribune of political of science and law	China	4	Chinese	Guangdong Sheng zheng fa guan li gan bu xue yu	Law -- China -- Shaanxi Sheng -- Periodicals.
49	1	1	1	1		University of Western Australia law review.	Australia	2	English	University of Western Australia.; Faculty of Law	Law reviews -- Australia.
50	1	1	1	1		Widener law journal.	United States		English	Widener University.; School of Law.	Public law -- United States

were often more useful in differentiating between Category 1 and Category 3. Category 3 publications were unlikely to be published by academic-like bodies and the WorldCat descriptors for Category 3 usually included terms like “legal digests” or “digest” or “law reform” or “law and legislation.”

The Publisher Marker column in Table A-3 indicates that 26 of the 50 periodicals categorized as “Scholarly Law Journals – General” were published by an academic or academic-like unit. This constitutes 52% of the entire sample. However, we had no information on the corporate publisher for fifteen periodicals; thus 74% of the known publishers were academic. Thirty-nine of the Category 1 periodicals (78% of the sample) had titles that indicated they were general, scholarly periodicals. That is, they included terms such as journal, review, magazine, etc.; or contained the name of a university. Forty percent of the sample had both clear publisher and title markers. Finally, 90% of the Category 1 entries had general WorldCat descriptors, though one (#2) had both a general descriptor and a specialty term (Real Property) that was not reflected in the title. Thirty percent of the categorizations had all three markers. Thus, while most of the Category 1 categorizations are defensible, there are four clear misclassifications and one ambiguous classification. These are indicated in column 5, More Likely Category. Three of the journals (#10, #31 and #35) are specialty journals that belong in Category 2. One (#19) is a professionally oriented periodical that belongs in Category 5 – the determining factor is the fact that it is published twice a week. Most of the scholarly journals have no more than four issues a year, though a handful has twelve. The one questionable categorization (#2) has the earmarks of a general scholarly journal but includes the term “real property” among its WorldCat descriptors. Thus, it could belong to Category 2.

The random sample of periodicals listed as “Scholarly Law Journals – Specialty” are reported in Table A-4. All three markers were useful in identifying these publications. When the publisher was an academic or an academic-like unit, the Publisher Marker is given a ‘1.’ When the publication’s title indicates a scholarly journal with a specialized orientation, the Title Marker is given a ‘1.’ Finally, when the WorldCat descriptor indicates a periodical with a specialized orientation, the Descriptor Marker is given a ‘1’ – unless it also includes a descriptor associated with Category 3 or 4 (e.g., legal digest, law and legislation, etc.)

The Publisher Marker column in Table A-4 indicates that 19 of the periodicals categorized as “Scholarly Law Journals – Specialized” were published by an academic or academic-like unit. This constitutes 38% of the entire sample. However, we had no information on the corporate publisher for twenty periodicals; thus 63% of the known publishers were academic. Forty-four of the Category 2 periodicals (88% of the sample) had titles that indicated they were specialized, scholarly periodicals. Thirty-eight percent of the sample had both clear publisher and title markers. Finally, 74% of the Category 2 entries had WorldCat descriptors associated with Category 2. Four of the entries without descriptor markers had clear publisher markers; six had clear title marker; three had both title and publisher markers. There were, however, three entries that were misclassifications (6%); all (#23, #28, #46) should have been placed in Category 4.

Table A-5 includes the random sample of periodicals listed as “Law Digests: General.” The most important markers here were the title and descriptor markers. Thirty-four of the publications categorized in Category 3 (68%) had clear descriptor markers (e.g., “Law reports, digests,” “Law reform,” “Law and legislation,” etc.) and another thirty-two had clear title markers (i.e., the title

indicated that they were digests, annotations, surveys, etc.). Twenty-one of the publications had both title and descriptor markers and all but four publications had one or the other (92%). Of the four publications in Category 3 that did not have either a title or a descriptor marker three had publisher markers (i.e. they were published by a private entity or some type of law reform commission). Only 23 of the entries had publisher markers, but there were 20 entries with no information on publisher. Thus, well over half of the entries with information on publishers indicated that the publishers were either private entities or law commissions (58%). Despite the fact that much information on the publisher was missing, this information was crucial in identifying a clear misclassification (#8) – which is a case reporter that belongs to Category 9. The title markers indicate that one other entry (#38) belongs to Category 2 because it is a university publication. Also, one other entry (#14) likely belongs to Category 4 because the title is specialized. Finally, one last entry (#8) is simply ambiguous based on the publisher, the Russian ministry of justice.

The random sample of periodicals listed as “Law Digests: Specialized” is reported in Table A-6. If the publisher was a private entity or non-academic association, the Publisher Marker is given a ‘1.’ Using titles to identify Category 4 publications was a bit more challenging than in the other categories because sometimes terms associated with more scholarly publications (review, annals, journal, magazine, etc.) are combined with highly specific terms not normally associated with scholarly publications (social security law, health and safety provisions, boiler and pressure vessel law, etc.). Thus, the existence of terms that indicated some specialized practical focus was used in assigning a ‘1’ to the Title Marker column in Category 4 cases. Finally, when the WorldCat descriptor contains terms such as “Law reports, digests” or “Law and Legislation,” the Descriptor Marker is given a ‘1.’

There are only 28 known publishers for the 50 periodicals contained in Table A-6 and 24 had clear publisher markers – 48% of the sample and 86% of those with publisher information. There were only two academic entities (#25 and #41) included in the known publishers and both of these involved periodicals with highly applied foci (goods and services tax, computers). Thirty-four of the publications in Table A-6 had title markers that suggested a specialized publication that focused on compiling and annotating law and legal developments. Finally, 33 of the publications had descriptor markers. Eighty percent of the periodicals in Table A-6 had at least two markers; 16% had all three markers. Only one had none (#30) – and it was a clear misclassification that should have been placed in Category 2. In addition, there are three other publications (#11, #18, and #44) that are misclassified. All of these appear to be so practice-oriented that they should have been placed in Category 5.

Table A-4
Random Sample of Specialized Scholarly Law Journals (Category 2)

Entry	Publisher Marker?	Title Marker?	Descriptor Marker?	More Likely Category	English Title	Country	Volumes per Year	Language	Authors
1	1	1	1		Bulletin of international legal institute	Soviet Union		French	Institut juridique international (Hague).
2	1	1			Brazilian Journal of aeronautics law	Brazil	4	Portuguese	Sociedade Brasileira de Direito Aeronáutico.
3		1	1		American civil law journal.	United States		English	
4		1	1		Journal of German Civil Law and French Civil Law	Germany		German	
5		1	1		Magazine of International Economic Right	Venezuela	2	Spanish	
6	1	1	1		Boston College environmental affairs law review.	United States		English	Boston College. Law School.
7		1	1		Brazilian journal of processional law.	Brazil		Portuguese	
8	1	1	1		Interdisciplinary publication on race, religion, gender, and class.	United States	2	English	University of Maryland at Baltimore.; School of Law
9		1	1		Belgian journal of maritime law	Belgium	12	French	
10	1	1			Villanova sports & entertainment law journal.	United States		English	Villanova University.; School of Law.
11	1	1	1		Law, Immigration and Citizenship	Italy	4	Italian	Associazione per gli studi giuridici magistratura democratica.
12	1	1	1		Series of the Conventions on "Problems of Law and Civil Proceed	Italy		Italian	Centro nazionale di prevenzione e difesa sociale.
13			1		Soochow annual	China		Chinese	Dong Wu da xue (Taipei, Taiwan)
14		1			Administrative Right	Chile		Spanish	
15		1	1		Criminal Law Annual	Belgium	1	French	
16	1	1	1		Aragonese magazine of public administration	Spain	2	Spanish	Departamento de Presidencia y Relaciones Institucionales.
17		1			EAGLE: Journal of the exchange on ageing, law and ethics.	United Kingdom		English	Age Concern England
18	1	1	1		Spanish Magazine of military rights	Spain	2	Spanish	Instituto Francisco de Vitoria.;
19	1	1	1		Journal of tax studies.	Brazil	6	Portuguese	Instituto de Estudos Tributários
20		1			Review of law and jurisprudence of the separation of church and	France	12	French	
21	1	1	1		The Defender	Philippines		English	Philippine Constitution Association.
22		1	1		Security and legal scientific social and psychological studies	Lebanon		Arabic	
23		1		4	New Series for the Civil and Criminal Law	Germany		German	Scholz, J.; der Dritte.
24	1	1	1		Journal of international affairs	Bangladesh	4	English	Bangladesh Institute of Law and International Affairs
25		1	1		International review of law and economics	United Kingdom	2	English	
26		1	1		Chung hsing law review	China	1	Chinese	Guo li zhong xing da xue.
27		1	1		The Law of International Relations	Italy	2	Italian	
28	1	1	1	4	Computer/law journal.	United States	4	English	Center for Computer/Law.
29		1	1		Research on Environmental law	China	1	Chinese	Wang, Shuyi.
30		1	1		The legal present time	Spain	3	Spanish	Urfa & Menéndez.
31	1	1	1		Magazine of Penal Right	Mexico	4	Spanish	Universidad Autónoma de San Luis Potosí.
32			1		The Nemesis	Italy		Italian	
33		1	1		The Journal of the Law and Commerce Society	China		English	
34	1	1	1		Houston business and tax law journal	United States	2	English	University of Houston.; Law Center.
35		1	1		Ohio State journal on dispute resolution.	United States	2	English	Hinchcliffe, Carole L.
36			1		Letter of Alms	Pakistan	4	Urdu	Subai Zakat-i Intizamiyah.
37		1	1		Journal of ethics, law, and aging.	United States	2	English	
38		1	1		New Criminal Policy	Germany	4	German	
39	1	1	1		Legal and Economic Sciences	Switzerland	1	German	Universität des Saarlandes.
40		1	1		Folk law	China	1	Chinese	Shandong da xue.; Li lun fa xue yan jiu zhong xin.
41	1	1	1		Yearbook of Admiralty Law	Chile	1	Spanish	Universidad de Chile.
42	1	1	1		Stanford environmental law annual.	United States	1	English	Stanford Environmental Law Society.
43	1	1	1		Peking University law journal	China	6	Chinese	Beijing da xue.; Law Faculty.
44		1	1		The South African company law journal.	South Africa	4	English	
45		1	1		Magazine of private and communitarian right.	Argentina	3	Spanish	
46		1	1	4	Investment & securities law journal.	Nigeria	4	English	
47		1	1		Seoul international law journal	Korea, South	2	Korean	Soul Kukchepop Yonguwon.
48		1	1		Review of administrative law and tax law	Switzerland	6	French	
49		1	1		Austrian journal of public and international law	Austria	4	German	
50		1	1		Center for Enterprise Law, University of Lausanne	Switzerland		French	Dessemontet, François.

Table A-5
Random Sample of General Legal Digests (Category 3)

Entry	Publisher Marker?	Title Marker?	Descriptor Marker?	More Likely Category	English Title	Country	Volumes per Year	Language	Authors	WorldCat Descriptors Abbreviated
1	1		1		Supreme Court doctrines	Philippines		English	Gupit, Fortunato.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Philippines.
2			1	9	The Argus law reports	Australia		English	High Court.;Victoria.; Supreme Court; Australia.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Australia -- Victoria.
3		1	1		Current law monthly digest	United Kingdom	12	English		Great Britain -- Periodicals. Law reports, digests, etc.
4	1	1	1		Majdi's digest of "al-Kuwait al-youm."	Kuwait	52	English	Awwad, Majdi S.	Law -- Kuwait -- Digests. Gazettes
5		1	1		Law journal for the year	United Kingdom		English		Law reports, digests, etc. -- Great Britain.
6		1			Monthly law digest	Korea, South (Rep.)	12	Korean		Law -- Korea (South) -- Periodicals.
7	1	1	1		West's New Mexico digest	Mexico	1	English	West Group	Law reports, digests, etc. -- New Mexico.
8			1	?	Soviet Jurisprudence	Russia	24	Russian	Russian S.F.S.R.; Ministerstvo iustitsii. ;	Russia (Federation) -- Law reports, digests, etc..
9	1	1	1		The Law reports	United Kingdom		English	Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for England.;	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Great Britain.
10		1			The Jurisprudential Bulletin	Hungary		Hungarian	Magyar Tudományos Akadémia.;	Law -- Hungary -- Periodicals.
11	1		1		The Reporter	United Kingdom		English	Ellis, Howard; Cox, Rowland.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- United States; Great Britain.
12		1			Lawyer digest	Taiwan	6	Chinese		Law -- Taiwan -- Periodicals.
13	1	1	1		NLR two years' law digest	Pakistan	0.5	English	Lahore Law Times Publications.;	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Pakistan.
14			1	4	Municipal journal of juridical issues	Brazil	4	Portuguese	Centro de Estudos Jurídicos do Pará. ; SEMAJ (Belém, Brazil)	Brazil -- Belém -- Periodicals. Law reports, digests, etc.
15	1	1	1		Weekly law digest	United Kingdom		English	Justice of the Peace Ltd.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Great Britain.
16		1	1		The law notes Karachi	Pakistan		English		Law reports, digests, etc. -- Pakistan -- Karachi.
17	1		1		Notes of recent judgments of Federal Appeals Court	Canada		English	Canadian Law Information Council.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Canada.
18	1	1	1		English reports annotated	United Kingdom		English	Robertson, Max. A.; (Maxwell Alexander)	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Great Britain.
19			1		Bulletin of Judicial Practice of the Supreme Court	Bosnia-Herzegovina	2	Bosnian	Bosnia and Hercegovina .	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Bosnia and Hercegovina
20			1		Jusisprudence of the Supreme Court, AP,	Guatemala		Spanish		Law reports, digests, etc. -- Spain.
21	1	1	1		Laws information and summaries	Portugal		Portuguese	Oliveira, Ernesto de.	Law -- Portugal -- Digests.
22			1		Current law year book	United Kingdom	1	English		Law reports, digests, etc. -- Great Britain.
23			1		Notebooks of Jurisprudence	Argentina		Spanish	Universidad de Buenos Aires.;	Argentina -- Periodicals. Law reports, digests, etc.
24		1			Commentary on the Constitutional Court's decisions	Korea, South (Rep.)	1	Korean	Honpop Chaep'anso (South Korea).	Constitutional law -- Korea (South) -- Cases. Judicial review
25		1			Hebei Legal System Yearbook	China	0.5	Chinese	Hebei fa zhi nian jian bian zuan wei yuan hui.	Law -- China -- Henan Sheng -- Periodicals.
26			1		The Legal Magazine	Morocco		Arabic	Ma'had al-Qadai al-Urduni.	Law reports, digests, etc. Law -- Jordan -- Periodicals.
27	1	1	1		Northeastern digest	United States		English	West Publishing Company.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- United States.
28			1		Annual survey of South African law	South Africa	1	English	University of the Witwatersrand.; Faculty of Law.	Legislation -- Law -- South Africa.
29	1	1	1		Supreme Court of Nigeria quarterly law reports	Nigeria	4	English	Quadri, Funmilayo Adunni.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Nigeria.
30			1		Annual Supreme Court digest	India	1	English	Pandit, Manjula.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- India.
31	1		1		Annals of the Mexican Forum	Argentina	52	Spanish	Otero, Ignacio	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Mexico.
32	1				Magazine of Legislation ordinate	Argentina	24	Spanish	Clavell Borrás, Javier.	Law -- Argentina -- Periodicals.
33	1	1			Juta's constitutional law bulletin	South Africa	12	English	Juta and Company, Ltd.	Constitutional law -- South Africa -- Cases.
34			1		Significant decisions of the Supreme Court	United States	1	English	American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Research.	Constitutional law -- United States -- Digests
35			1		Legislation and Jurisprudence	Argentina		Spanish	Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México.	Law -- Mexico. Law reports, digests, etc.
36		1			Canada watch	Canada	8	English	York University (Toronto, Ont.); Centre for Public Law	Constitutional law -- Canada.
37	1	1			Annotated legislation service	United Kingdom		English	Butterworths	Law -- Great Britain.
38				2	Yearbook of the College of Law and Administration	Germany	1	German	Hochschule für Recht und Verwaltung (Germany)	Law -- Germany (East) -- Public administration.
39		1	1		The J.P. weekly law digest	United Kingdom		English	Justice of the Peace Ltd.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Great Britain.
40		1			Periodical of legislation, doctrine, and civil jurisprudence	France				Law -- France -- Periodicals.
41	1				Michie's annotated statutes of New Mexico	Mexico	3	English	Michie Company. ; New Mexico	Law -- New Mexico.
42	1				Report	India		English	Indian Law Commission.	Justice, Administration of -- India -- Periodicals.
43	1	1	1		Notes of recent judgments of the Federal Court of Appeal	Canada	12	English	Canadian Law Information Council.	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Canada.
44		1			Clipping of the Nowadays Law Situations	Indonesia	12	Indonesian	Centre for Strategic and International Studies.	Law -- Indonesia -- Periodicals.
45	1	1	1		Annotated cases, American and English.	Canada		English	Greene, H. Noyes; McKinney, William Mark;	Law reports, digests, etc. -- US. Great Britain, Canada
46	1	1	1		Abortion, constitutional and legal developments	Canada		English	Canada.; Library of Parliament.; Research Branch.	Abortion -- Law and legislation -- Canada -- Periodicals.
47			1		Yearbook of Court Law	Germany	1	German	Institut für Kammerrecht.	Trade associations -- Law and legislation -- Germany.
48		1	1		Hong Kong law digest yearbook	China	1	English		Law reports, digests, etc. -- China -- Hong Kong.
49	1	1			China legal developments bulletin.	China	10	English	Baker & McKenzie.	Law -- China -- Periodicals.
50		1	1		Hong Kong current law	China	11	English		Law reports, digests, etc. -- China -- Hong Kong.

Table A-6
Random Sample of Specialized Legal Digests (Category 4)

Entry	Publisher Marker?	Title Marker?	Descriptor Marker?	More Likely Category	English Title	Country	Volumes per Year	Language	Authors	WorldCat Descriptors Abbreviated
1		1	1		Legislation and economy	Russia	12	Russian	Fond sodestviiia molodym deputatam "Novoe pokolenie."	Commercial law -- Russia. Industrial laws and legislation.
2		1			Information technology law reports	United Kingdom	6	English		Information technology -- Great Britain -- Cases.
3		1	1		Periodical of Consumer Law	Suriname	4	Dutch; Some English.		Consumer protection -- Law and legislation -- Netherlands.
4		1	1		Yearbook of Labor Law	Germany	1	German		Labor laws and legislation -- Germany. Reports, digests, etc
5	1	1	1		Highlights of state unemployment compensation laws	United States	1	English	National Foundation for Unemployment Compensation	Insurance, Unemployment -- Law and legislation
6	1	1			Annual review of criminal law	Canada	1	English	Tanovich, David M.	Criminal procedure -- Canada -- Periodicals.
7		1	1		Legal collection of the East	France	12			Social security -- Law reports, digests, etc. -- France.
8		1	1		Review of the Law of Social Security	Italy	2	Italian		Social security -- Law and legislation -- EU countries.
9	1	1	1		Synopsis of boiler and pressure vessel laws and regulation	Canada	0.5	English	Uniform Boiler and Pressure Vessel Laws Society	Pressure vessels -- Law and legislation
10		1			Journal of shipping, customs & transport laws	India	12	English		Maritime law -- India -- Cases
11	1		1	5	Qualified retirement and other employee benefit plans	United States	1	English	Canan, Michael J.	Pension trusts -- Law and legislation -- United States
12		1			Martin's annals of crime	United Kingdom	52	English		Criminal law -- Great Britain -- Periodicals.
13		1			Georgia corporation laws	United States	1	English		Corporation law -- Georgia.
14		1	1		Health & safety monitor	United Kingdom		English		Industrial hygiene -- Law and legislation -- Great Britain
15		1	1		Economic and commercial law review	China	1	Chinese	Zhong yang cai jing da xue.;	Industrial laws and legislation -- Commercial law -- China.
16		1	1		Pakistan company & tax law reports	Pakistan	1	English; some Urdu		Taxation -- Law and legislation -- Pakistan. Corporation law
17		1	1		Updates on Social Security	Mexico	12	Spanish		Social security -- Law and legislation -- Argentina
18			1	5	Bulletin of practical documentations of sales tax	France	12			Taxation -- Law and legislation -- France
19	1	1			UCC bulletin	United States	12	English	Callaghan and Company.;	Commercial law -- United States -- States
20		1			Archive for Civil Practice	France		German		Civil procedure -- Germany -- Periodicals.
21		1			Legislative Economic Bulletin	Romania		Romanian		Commercial law -- Romania.
22	1	1	1		Federal access to information and privacy legislation annotated	Canada	1	English	Drapeau, Michel W., Racicot, Marc-Aurèle	Public records -- Law and legislation -- Canada.
23	1	1	1		Foreign capital funds: abridged legislation	Brazil		English	(Brazil).;	Investments, Foreign -- Law and legislation -- Brazil.
24	1	1			The Australian criminal reports	Australia		English	Rinaldi, Fiori	Criminal law -- Australia -- Cases.
25		1	1		Digit@1: Digest of information technology and the law	Philippines	4	English	University of the Philippines.; Internet and Society Program	Computers -- Law and legislation -- Philippines.
26		1	1		Law and patrimony	France	12			Law -- France. Law reports, digests, etc.
27	1	1	1		Federal estate and gift tax reporter.	United States		English	Commerce Clearing House	Inheritance and transfer tax -- Law and legislation
28	1	1			BNA's environment library on compact disc	United States	12	English	Bureau of National Affairs (Washington, D.C.)	Environmental law -- United States. Chemical industry.
29	1	1			Legal notebooks and export taxation	France	6		Centre français du commerce extérieur	Foreign trade regulation -- Periodicals.
30				2	The Diplomatic review	United Kingdom		English		International law and relations -- Periodicals.
31	1	1	1		Lancaster's health & safety law reporter	Canada	10	English	Lancaster House	Industrial hygiene -- Law and legislation -- Canada.
32	1				Informational bulletin	Russia		Russian	Tsentralnyi nauchno-issledovatel'skii institut Morskogo Flota.	Maritime law -- Russia -- Shipping -- Periodicals.
33		1			Administrative law reports	Canada	1	English		Administrative law -- Canada -- Cases.
34	1		1		Journal of tax law of APET	Brazil		Portuguese	Associação Paulista de Estudos Tributários	Taxation -- Law and legislation -- Brazil. Digests.
35		1			Environment policy & law	Canada	12	English		Environmental policy -- Canada -- Periodicals.
36	1		1		Collection of jurisprudence and administrative law	Belgium	4		Institut belge des sciences administratives	Administrative courts -- Belgium. Law reports, digests, etc.
37	1		1		Tax law	France			Life Underwriters Association of Canada	Taxation -- Law and legislation -- Canada.
38		1	1		Essential tax legislation	Australia	1	English		Income tax -- Law and legislation -- Australia.
39	1	1	1		Environment reporter	United States		English	Bureau of National Affairs (Washington, D.C.)	Environmental policy -- Law and legislation -- United States
40	1	1			Soviet business law report	Soviet Union	12	English	Bureau of National Affairs (Washington, D.C.)	Commercial law -- Soviet Union. Corporation law.
41			1		Bulletin	United Kingdom		English	University of London; Institute of Advanced Legal Studies	Goods and services tax -- Law and legislation -- Canada.
42	1				Bulletin of Chemical Hygienists	Italy		Italian	Unione italiana chimici igienisti	Environmental law -- Italy -- Periodicals.
43	1		1		The Peruvian: Supreme Executions	Peru		Spanish	Mimbela Pérez, Jesús	Law reports, digests, etc. -- Peru.
44	1		1	5	Corporate political activities	United States		English	Practising Law Institute	Corporations -- Political activity -- Law and legislation
45	1	1	1		Henry B. Zimmer's Taxation & business decisions	Canada		English	Zimmer, Henry B.	Income tax -- Law and legislation -- Canada -- Periodicals.
46	1		1		Bulletin of the Institute of National Social Provision	Argentina	4	Spanish	Investigaciones Jurídicas.	Social security -- Law and legislation -- Argentina.
47	1		1		Magazine of fiscal jurisprudence	Argentina	2	Spanish	Grellaud, Guillermo D.	Taxation -- Law and legislation -- Peru. Finance, Public.
48			1		Utilities law review	United Kingdom	6	English		Public utilities -- Law and legislation -- Great Britain.
49			1		Journal of the tribunal of commerce	France	12			Commercial law -- France. Law reports, digests, etc.
50		1			The Law Book Company's commercial legislation	Australia	12	English		Commercial law -- Australia. Securities -- Cases

Several observations are worth noting with respect to the analysis of the four random samples summarized in Tables A-3 – A-6. The most obvious is that misclassifications identified range between 6-10% of the entries. Less obvious is the fact that all but one misclassification falls within categories 1-5; there was one set of case reports that should have been placed within Category 9. More than a third of the misclassifications were practitioner-oriented publications that were hard to distinguish from the others. The fact that between 90-94% of the classifications are defensible is reassuring. So is the fact that the vast majority of misclassifications were “close.” If a large of categories with very different types of publications (7s, 8s, 11s, etc.) had appeared in these tables, then the classification procedures would have been suspect. Moreover, the high factor loadings reported in the text (see Table _) suggest that miscategorizations across the first four categories (i.e., a Category 3 periodical classified as a Category 1 periodical) would not have much of an impact on a country’s composite legal infrastructure score.

The above discussion notwithstanding, Tables A-3 – A-6 only include a handful of randomly selected cases. To determine how robust the above findings are, we drew two additional random samples of 50 cases for Categories 1-4. The results are reported in Table A-7 and they are very consistent with the results reported above. The misclassifications identified in these other samples ranged between 2-8%, with an average of 6% (compared to about 7% in the initial samples). Moreover, of the 22 misclassifications, all but 3 fell with categories 1-4; the other three belonged to Category 5.

**Table A-7
Summary of Results for Multiple Random Samples**

Category	Sample #1		Sample #2		Sample #3	
	Percent Mis-categorized	More Likely Category	Percent Mis-categorized	More Likely Category	Percent Mis-categorized	More Likely Category
1	8-10	2,2,2,5,?	2	2	4	2,2
2	6	4,4,4	6	1,4,4	6	4,4,4
3	6-8	9,2,4,?	8	1,1,1,4	6	1,2,4
4	8	2,5,5,5	8	1,2,5,5	4-6	2,5,?

Estimating Missing Values

Two sub-dimensions of the legal periodical measures we desire to construct deal with temporal variables: whether a given legal periodical was available in a given year and the length of the periodical’s run. To calculate these temporal variables we need information on both the date that a periodical began publishing and the date it ceased publishing (if it is defunct). The WorldCat listings for these pieces of information contain a considerable amount of missing data. Thus, we initiated an effort to acquire the missing dates. To do this we examined WorldCat’s listings and identified the various libraries that had copies of the periodicals. We used on-line facilities of those libraries to find the missing dates information. This resulted in the identification of 962 ending dates and 150 beginning dates. This information, in conjunction with the information acquired directly from WorldCat downloads, produced exact information on beginning dates for

84% of the Category 1-4 periodicals, as well as 92% of the ending dates.⁴ Unfortunately, we had exact information on *both* dates in only about 77% of these periodicals. The existence of this amount of missing data is troubling because, by failing to incorporate information on temporal spans for a periodical that we know exists in a given country, we introduce error into the measurement procedure. Moreover, this could be systematic measurement error that could adversely affect our analysis. At the same time, imputing missing values inevitably introduces measurement error.

Three points suggest that the benefits of estimating missing values outweigh the cost of not estimating them. First, while at least one date is missing for nearly a quarter of the periodicals, we have partial information on some missing dates that can be used to provide some precision to the estimation procedure. For example, we have information on the decade in which a periodical began publishing (e.g., we know that the periodical began publishing in the 1920's) for 31% of the periodicals without exact beginning dates. We have decade estimates on ending dates for 13% of the periodicals with missing end dates. We have century estimates for most of the periodicals with missing beginning dates and 50% of the periodicals with missing ending dates. Indeed, we are totally lacking date information on only 5% of the periodicals (i.e., we have neither exact dates nor estimates). A second point is that the distribution of known starting dates reveals a good deal of structure within a country over time. For many countries, emergence of certain types of periodicals is not randomly distributed over the course of its history. Rather, they appear in clusters, which can be used in conjunction with partial information on start dates (i.e., decade and century start dates) to craft a strategy to impute missing values.

A third, more subtle point is that, unlike in survey data, it is less important that we have a precise estimate for a given observation (e.g., a periodical). This is because the data on individual entries is aggregated to generate a country-year variable. Consider, for example, a country missing ten beginning dates for thirty Category 1 publications. As long as the estimation procedures are defensible and the error produced is random, the country-year estimates generated by the aggregation process are likely to be more accurate than the ten periodical-specific estimates. This is because some of the periodical-specific estimates will be earlier than the actual date while others will be later than the actual date. Consider situations in which we have a "decade estimate" (e.g., we know that two journals began circulation in the 1990's) and use the mid-point of the decade to fill in the missing start dates. If one actually began in 1992 and the other began in 1998, the aggregated figures will reflect the underlying realities more closely than the periodical-specific estimates.

The following procedure was used to impute missing date information where we had decade or century date estimates.⁵ We began with imputing missing starting dates for periodicals with decade estimates. A starting year was imputed for these periodicals by sampling five dates from the pool of known exact starting dates of legal publications for that particular country and decade. We computed the mean of the sample and expressed the mean as an integer, which became the imputed missing value. For the remaining missing start dates (i.e., those without decade estimates) we applied the same procedure, this time using century estimates. The same

⁴ If neither WorldCat nor our on-line search indicated that a periodical ceased operations, we presume it is active.

⁵ If there were no exact starting dates for a given country and decade – or country and century – no imputed values were computed.

procedure was used to calculate missing ending dates. We then used the imputed start and end dates to calculate a publication's estimated "run." When this run was negative (i.e., the start date was after the end date), the missing date variable was reset to missing; this only happened in a small set of cases using century estimates.

This procedure allowed us to generate valid date variables for 1189 publications. Thus, of the 7544 periodicals in categories 1-4 we were able to employ 6978 (93%) in the calculation of the density and duration variables. For 374 of the 7544 periodicals it was not possible to apply the missing value procedure.